

APPENDIX 1 - Puddock Road Safety Scheme Options Matrix

Table 1 - Options Matrix							
	Speed Reduction	Weight Restriction	High Casualty Route Signage plus Comms. Campaign and removal of Direction signage	Physical closure	"non-physical" closure with enforcement cameras	Vehicle Restraint System	Carriageway widening and narrowing with raised rib lining
Summary of Measure	Reduction of speed limit from 60mph to 30mph along narrow section from Forty Foot Road to Ramsey Hollow. Inclusion of buffer zone and supporting physical measures to support as appropriate. In addition officers believe that a trial section of the edge of carriageway should be treated with a gabion mattress solution to seek to prevent the deep rutting. The value indicated is for a trial of 25% of one side of the carriageway, at £30K.	Introduction of a weight restriction to reduce heavy good vehicles using Puddock Road, with access to property permitted.	Installation of High Casualty Route signage with a targeted communications campaign highlighting the risk of accidents along Puddock Road. Removal of existing signage that directs routes via Puddock Road.	Reduction in number of vehicle using Puddock Road through installation of a physical barrier to prevent vehicles using Puddock Road as a through-route	Reduction in number of vehicles using Puddock Road through implementation of a TRO with use of enforcement cameras and signage to show the road can be used for access only.	Installation of a smart raft vehicle restraint system along the highway boundary adjacent to Crease Drain	Widen the carriageway and demarcate the edge of carriageway with a raised rib line
Estimated Implementation Cost	£65,000	£35,000	£35,000	£65,000	£105,000	£1,800,000-£3,600,000	£1,800,000
Ongoing maintenance or running costs per year	No change from current	No change from current	No change from current	No change from current	£8,000	10,000	£12,150
Key Risks	Lack of enforcement	Lack of enforcement. May require further data collection and to ascertain effect on local network	High Casualty Route signage is reserved for major high speed routes, and is reserved for exceptional location. There is a risk that the use of this type of sign might dilute the message of the existing small number of these signs in the County Signage only unlikely to satisfy requirements of coroner, and should be considered alongside other measures e.g. speed limit reduction	Will require the provision of a turning head - it may be possible to utilise existing highway space. Will cause traffic to divert through Ramsey or Chatteris Lengthy diversion route may have negative impact on local business. May require further data collection to ascertain effect on local network, and consequently the moderate increase in user generated carbon	Lack of funding for ongoing costs Civil enforcement powers expected to be in place at the end of 2024 for the length covered by Huntingdonshire District Council. Enforcement cameras could also be used to enforce the speed limit. An informal local consultation will be needed before the required Traffic Regulation Order can be advertised. Vandalism of cameras. Traffic will be diverted through Ramsey and Chatteris. May require further data collection to ascertain effect on local network, and consequently, the moderate increase in user generated carbon. Lengthy diversion route may have negative impact on local business.	Phased delivery would be required due to scheme cost; Significant risk of funding being unavailable in subsequent years leaving the scheme incomplete. Barriers may subside over time despite enhanced foundation design. Significant embedded carbon footprint due to the precast concrete foundation units and steel barriers To fully prevent vehicles leaving the carriageway would need barrier either side of carriageway, which double costs to £3.6m	An improved carriageway surface may encourage more drivers to use this route and potentially higher speeds, which in turn may increase the risk of casualties. The budget cost exceeds the budget available and would therefore require phased implementation. The raised rib lining would be constantly over-run by farm vehicles, which would necessitate frequent renewal to maintain the effectiveness.
Public Support	Traffic Regulation Order process is complete with no objections. The TRO for the 40mph buffer zone to the south is being progressed.	Would need an exception for residents' farm vehicles. The diversion for the route is approximately 24.7km and 25.3km via Ramsey and Chatteris respectively. This is likely to be unpopular with businesses who legitimately use the route.	May be perceived as insufficient action	Depending upon location, the closure could sever land parcels, leading to hardship for farmers who are forced to follow the diversion, pushing agricultural traffic onto major routes. The diversion for the route is approximately 24.7km and 25.3km via Ramsey and Chatteris respectively. This is likely to be unpopular with businesses who legitimately use the route.	Residents and businesses would be required to apply for an exemption and the onus would be upon them to keep this updated. May be more well-received that a physical closure. Low flows on Puddock Road may not generate sufficient revenue from fines to cover running costs.	Could lead to precedent setting and requests for VRS at other similar locations, of which there are many miles in the County area. Potential for questions around high cost of intervention in the context of low traffic route.	Likely to be well received as this option will provide a much improved road surface Potential for questions around high cost of intervention in the context of low traffic route.
RAG Rating							