

**Planning Application No. S/0204/16/CW – Importation by Rail and Deposit of Inert Restoration Material to Restore Former Clay and Chalk Quarry – Barrington Quarry, Haslingfield Road, Barrington, Cambridgeshire**

**Matters for the Deferral of Consideration of Planning Application, Planning Committee 6<sup>th</sup> September 2018**

Members of the Planning Committee at their meeting of the 6<sup>th</sup> September 2018 resolved to defer consideration of the above application pending further discussions between officers and the applicant regarding the following issues: -

- signage (presumably at Foxtan Sidings regards idling times and locations);
- age of locomotives;
- age of rolling stock;
- brake squeal;
- the impact on development viability of reducing frequency to 2 trains per day;
- a further consideration of locomotive idling times;
- the feasibility of completing the development in 15 years, and;
- whether or not any of the above will impinge on the feasibility of Redrow providing the cycleway parallel to railway.

The following is the applicant's response to the issues raised by Planning Committee members.

Signage

CEMEX is happy to erect signage within Foxtan Exchange Sidings advising train crews of restrictions regards locomotive idling times and the appropriate stabling locations. The nature and location of such signage could form part of a mitigation scheme to be submitted to officers within 3 months of the date on which the permission is issued.

Age of Locomotives

CEMEX is advised by train operators accessing the site that there are only four modern classes of locomotive suitable to haul trains accessing the application site; these are Classes 59, 60, 66 and 70. Classes 67 and 68 are not considered suitable due to their limited tractive effort. Classes 60 and 66 are by far the most numerous locomotives and can be considered to be the mainstay of rail freight operations in the UK. Were CEMEX unable to accept locomotives within these classes due to their age, the pool of locomotives considered suitable would shrink to the extent that the Company's ability to obtain appropriate haulage would be compromised.

Age of Rolling Stock

CEMEX is unable to stipulate the age of the rolling stock used in accessing the application site but there is no direct correlation between rolling stock age and brake squeal; the key issue is the application of the train brakes. The Company cannot

give an undertaking that no trains will need to brake or stop at any of the level crossings. Unforeseen circumstances arise where this is the only safe course of action; nevertheless trains should not be stopping or braking as a matter of course, rather this should be the exception rather than the rule. One means to achieve this is to ensure that the Glebe Road crossing is manned separately from those at Haslingfield and Foxton Roads. The Company has committed to this via the submitted Barrington Light Railway Operating Manual.

#### Impact of reducing train number

A reduction in train numbers into the application site will have a negative impact on CEMEX's ability to win contracts for suitable restoration material, especially from large scale works such as HS2. This is because this type of contract requires the accommodation of material in a set timeframe that is governed by the speed at which becomes available. If a potential reception site cannot accommodate the volume of material required within the timeframe it is likely to be generated the site becomes less attractive to the generator of the material, placing Barrington at a disadvantage.

Reducing the number of trains to two per day would, given the same assumptions made regards the rate of fill that underpin the current application, would extend the life of the development to 21 years. CEMEX does not seek to increase the number of trains overall, this will remain three per day as an average. For every day that four trains are accepted this will mean a day later in that month where only two trains will be permitted.

#### Locomotive Idling Times

It is accepted that it is proposed to extend the permitted idling time from 15 to 30 minutes as part of the proposed development. 30 minutes is not a target however, it is a maximum, and is proposed on the basis of experience gained in from the operation of the branch line; 15 minutes is not always sufficient for the train crews to be able to start the locomotive, charge the train braking systems, undertake the required safety checks and a small amount of contingency that is sometimes needed to accommodate small delays that can occur between the crew being notified by Network Rail staff they can enter the mainline network and the signal actually changing to green. The submitted noise assessment of the 4<sup>th</sup> June concludes that a locomotive idling for 30 minutes at point Y as illustrated by drawing no.

16\_C018\_BARR\_300 would not result in a breach of the noise limit at Foxton Exchange sidings proposed by officers. This contrasts with the extant situation at Foxton sidings where there are no noise limits between the hours of 0700 and 2300. Any departing locomotive will be required to stable at point Y as illustrated by drawing no. 16\_C018\_BARR\_300, as far away from College Farm as is possible; this requirement will be reinforced by signage as discussed above and incorporated into driver induction. No trains will be accepted into the sidings prior to 0700 without

the submission, approval and implementation of additional mitigation measures, and none will be accepted after 2000.

Having discussed the issue of train crew welfare with the trains crews it is proposed to erect a small modular mess facility adjacent to Foxtan Level Crossing, removing the need for them to leave their locomotive idling to maintain the cab heating system. CCTV will also be installed so the Site Supervisor can monitor train activity in the sidings.

The Company has investigated the alleged instances of extended idling that Monitoring Officers have brought to its attention. These instances have been due to exceptional network conditions such as poor weather damaging the overhead power lines or other network disruption beyond the control of both CEMEX and the train operator. CEMEX will make every endeavour to advise local residents when it becomes aware of such situations and the extent to which it may result in extended locomotive idling.

#### Development Timescale

The assumptions made in calculating the lifespan of the proposed development are somewhat conservative in order to provide a degree of contingency. It is assumed that the site will be available to accept trains for 240 days a year, in fact in 2018 site availability will be 248 days. Using an assumption of 248 working days per year the predicted life of the development reduces to just over 14 years. Additionally, although Phase 4 is the last phase that requires the importation of restoration material, it also requires the restoration of the loading platform which would preclude the acceptance of further trains. Applying current assumptions, the operation of the branch line is likely to cease 13.5 years after any permission is first implemented, with the remaining 1.5 years used to reprofile and restore restoration material on site. Assuming a 248 working day year, this is reduced to 13 years.

Appendix D of the Supporting Statement is an assessment of the likely availability of a suitable of feedstock to supply the proposed restoration. It concludes that due to a lack of future capacity, recent case law and a number of development projects in the South East, either proposed or underway there remains a demonstrable need for the facility CEMEX proposes. The proposed restoration scheme allows CEMEX to offer potential customers security of availability which the current scheme does not, which will boost its ability to secure the long term contracts that the site is most suited to.

#### Cycleway

None of the above will impede the ability for the proposed cycleway to be constructed parallel with the branch line in the Company's view.

## Proposed Hours of Operation

Although not specifically referred to by Members of the Committee it is opportune to clarify what is being proposed by CEMEX: -

Operation	Current Permitted Hours of Operation	Proposed Permitted Hours of Operation
Restoration including train unloading	0600 - 2200	0600 to 2200, but with restrictions on the nature of operations at certain locations between 0600 and 0700 and 2000 and 2200 in relation to both Wilsmere Down Farm and the proposed new housing
Rail Operation within the Quarry	0600 - 2200	0700 – 2000
Operation of the branchline between Haslingfield and Foxton Roads Level Crossings	0700 - 2000	0700 - 2000
Foxton Exchange Sidings	No Restrictions	0700 – 2000, although in exceptional circumstances trains may leave the sidings for the mainline up to 2200. Trains may be accepted into the sidings from 0530 if a noise mitigation scheme is submitted to and approved by the Waste Planning Authority, and fully implemented by the operator.

To summarise: -

- CEMEX is happy to implement a signage scheme within Foxton Exchange sidings to remind train crews of the requirements of operating within the sidings, and to agree the details with officers;
- The pool of what might be seen as ‘modern’ freight locomotives suitable to work Barrington trains is small and would be likely to render the project unviable. CEMEX undertakes to bar access to any locomotive constructed prior to 1985, with the majority of the locomotives visiting the site likely to be drawn from Class 66 (as they are by far the numerous of the remaining suitable classes), built between 1998 and 2015;
- CEMEX is not able to stipulate the age of the rolling stock used by the train provider, but age is not a guarantee of minimal brake squeal. It is prepared to

continue to operate the branch in such a way as to minimise instances of brake squeal, primarily by deploying the resourced necessary to ensure that trains can pass through all the level crossings with needing to stop or brake, except in emergency situations;

- Reducing the number of trains to two per day will extend the life of the project to 21 years, with trains operational for just over 20 years;
- The 30 minutes idling time is not a target and contains a degree of contingency to accommodate minor unforeseen delays. The noise assessment that forms part of the Environmental Statement demonstrates that noise conditions officers propose for Foxtan Sidings can be complied with accounting for up 30 minutes idling. A train crew mess facility will be provided for train crews to use in the winter in order that the locomotive does not have to left running for an extended period to provide heating;
- The anticipated 15 year development life contains within it both a degree of contingency and conservative assumptions regards site availability. The final 18 month of the restoration requires reprofiling of the material on site and the restoration of the train unloading platform, so no trains could be accepted. It is anticipated, therefore, that the operational life of the branch would extend to no more than 13.5 years from commencement;
- CEMEX has no reason to think that any of the above measures would comprise the provision of the cycleway, and;
- No trains will be accepted into Foxtan Exchange Sidings before 0700 until a noise mitigation scheme has been submitted to and approved by the Waste Planning Authority, and fully implemented by CEMEX. Pursuant to the current permission there is no restriction on when trains can be accepted into the sidings.

17<sup>th</sup> September 2018